Social Determinants of Health and Inequality within the Canadian Health Care System for those affected by Kidney Disease

Shannon Fogarasi, MSW, RSW
Director of Programs and Public Policy - Ontario Branch
BC Kidney Days 2018
Social Determinants Of Health

Definition:
The social determinants of health (SDH) are the conditions in which people are born, grow, work, live, and age, and the wider set of forces and systems shaping the conditions of daily life. These forces and systems include economic policies and systems, development agendas, social norms, social policies and political systems.

- WHO
Main Determinants Of Health

Source: Dahlgren & Whitehead 1991
### Micro Level Social Determinants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Stability</th>
<th>Neighborhood and Physical Environment</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Community and Social Context</th>
<th>Health Care System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>Hunger</td>
<td>Social integration</td>
<td>Health coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Access to healthy options</td>
<td>Support systems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenses</td>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>Early childhood education</td>
<td></td>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt</td>
<td>Parks</td>
<td>Vocational training</td>
<td>Social discrimination</td>
<td>Provider availability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical bills</td>
<td>Playgrounds</td>
<td>Higher education</td>
<td>Stress</td>
<td>Provider linguistic and cultural competency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Walkability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zip code / geography</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Health Outcomes**

Mortality, Morbidity, Life Expectancy, Health Care Expenditures, Health Status, Functional Limitations
Social Determinants Of Health – Impacts Of Chronic Kidney Disease

• Equity versus Equality
• Psycho-social and mental health
• Health Literacy
  Geography
• Access to health care
• Access to resources

Poverty
• Income- as in individual or “Household”
• Affordable housing
• Food security-renal diets
• Transportation
• Insurance coverage/uninsured
• Medication
The Canada Health Act requires provinces to provide all “medically necessary” services on a universal basis (comprehensiveness). All residents are provided access to public health-care insurance on equal terms and conditions (universality). However, provincial governments have great discretionary power because the Act does not provide a detailed list of insured services.
Inequitable health care is most often indirect and systemic. Indirect occurs when exactly the same services are provided to everybody (so that they appear fair) but when for cultural, religious, linguistic or other reasons it is not possible for members of one or more individuals or groups to benefit from those services. Thus, what might appear to be perfectly equitable access may not be what the individual or group needs.

Halwani, Sana" Racial Inequalities in access to health care services: Ontario Human Rights Commission: 2004
# Comparison Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basis for Comparison</th>
<th>Equity</th>
<th>Equality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meaning</td>
<td>Equity is the virtue of being just, even-handed and impartial.</td>
<td>Equality is described as a state, where everyone is at the same level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is it?</td>
<td>Means</td>
<td>End</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>Even</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognizes</td>
<td>Differences, and attempts to counteract unequal individual opportunities.</td>
<td>Sameness and treats everyone as equal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensures</td>
<td>People have what they need.</td>
<td>Providing everyone, the same things.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“The prevalent approach to managing kidney disease uses a disease model that separates the patient from the disease or problem. In this model the focus is on identifying the right strategy to solve a mechanical failure.”

Dr. Gavril Hercz
Nephrologist/Psychotherapist Humber River Hospital (Toronto)
Psycho-Social Impacts of Kidney Disease
Coping skills as a social determinant of health

• Moral distress
• Situational depression
• Impacts to self, family and community
• Loss of self, denial, grief
• Complexity and prolonging symptom burden
• Loss of independence
• Isolation and disassociation
• Impacts to self-esteem and self efficacy
Canadian Council Defines Health Literacy:

As the ability to obtain, understand and use health information.

An International Adult Literacy and Skills Survey of 23,000 Canadians indicated that **60% of Canadians lacked the capacity to obtain, understand and act on health information and services to make appropriate health decisions.**

(Canadian Council on Learning, 2007)

Health Literacy and Understanding The Complexities Around Self-Management

Understanding medication management

Information is not accessible often written in English at a higher level

Complexities of understanding treatment needs

Specialized renal and diabetic diets
Health Literacy

- Includes numeracy skills:
  - Calculating blood sugar levels
  - Measuring medications
  - Understanding nutrition labels
  - Calculating premiums, co-pays and deductibles
  - Creating monthly budgets
  - Managing a low fixed income
Impacts of Health Literacy and Poverty

- Limited awareness and knowledge of what financial assistance programs exists.
- Face greater difficulties in accessing social services.
- Often have difficulty filling out forms and applications.
- Decision making on purchasing food and meal planning is often based on accessibility and affordability of foods – this has an impact health eating and specialized renal diets.
- Insured/uninsured – financial constraints.
Illness and Household Income

- Imposes large financial burden on individuals and families.
- Loss of income due to illness and time off from work.
- Loss of employment as a result of the frequency and time required to be off from work to accommodate medical appointments, treatment times, and time waiting for home dialysis training as well as the training itself.
- Frequent call backs to the hospitals or renal clinic to manage the treatment needs.
The survey identified the increased cost to patients and their caregivers who complete dialysis treatments, transportation costs to and from hospital-based treatment, increased food supplements and medications needs.
Poverty is a Social Determinant Of Health

National Report.

• Nearly 50% indicated that their annual income decreased since starting dialysis.

• Of those respondents, more than half said that it decreased by 40% or more.
Of all respondents, 41% were below the Canadian Low Income Cut Off (LICO), compared to 8-14% of the general Canadian population.
Poverty is a Social Determinant Of Health

Federal Income Table, 2017

The following table applies to all provinces except Quebec.

Table 3 – Low Income Cut-Off (LICO)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Size of Family Unit</th>
<th>Minimum necessary income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 person (the sponsor)</td>
<td>$24,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 persons</td>
<td>$30,625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 persons</td>
<td>$37,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 persons</td>
<td>$45,712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 persons</td>
<td>$51,846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 persons</td>
<td>$58,473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 persons</td>
<td>$65,101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 7 persons, for each additional person, add</td>
<td>$6,628</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ontario sample 2016
Out-Of-Pocket Costs Related To Dialysis Treatment Are A Significant Burden

- Annual average out-of-pocket costs related to dialysis ranged from $1,400-$2,500 (depending on modality).
- 55% of respondents reported an annual household income less that $35,000.
- 23% of respondents reported an annual income of less than $20,000.
Housing is a Social Determinate of Health

• Anna, 53 year old women receiving dialysis treatments for the past 2 years.

• Within the last year had to stop working as she could not manage her work hours with her dialysis hours.

• She is receiving a modest work disability pension and Canada Pension Plan Disability.

• She brings home $1600 a month.
• She is afraid of being separated from her son as she knows the system will not look after him if he is in a shelter.

• She found a motel that will accept a long-term stay. She is paying $2,000 a month - well over what she brings home. Her debt is only rising.

• There is no adequate affordable homes for her and her son.
Barriers To Accessing Health Services

• Health services are typically located in urban centres
• Lack of availability in rural areas
• Long waiting list
• Lack of insurance coverage
• Uninsured
• Limited language access
Consequences of Barriers to Accessing Health Systems

- Unmet needs
- Delays in receiving appropriate care
- Inability to access preventative service
- Preventable hospitalizations
- Systemic biases
Geography is a Social Determinant of Health.

• Typically dialysis treatment centres are located in urban centers.
• Travelling can be 3-4 hours to receive treatment in many rural areas.
• Lack of access to available, accessible and affordable public transit systems, especially in rural areas.
Impacts on Medication and Food

- 33% of LICO respondents indicated that they had missed purchasing medications.

- 27% of LICO respondents reported that they had gone without food or basic necessities within the last 6 months of the survey.
What Is Needed?
Improve Health Literacy

Given the complexity of the treatment needs as well as maintaining the lifestyle that is required to sustain one’s health.

• Education needs to be accessible while addressing the learner’s needs.
• Information needs to be diversified in media options, in multiple languages and incorporate multiple cultural and traditional practices.
Creative Solutions

Equitable access to health care matches the need to an individuals need for care.

• Innovative ways to access health care remotely to prevent patients traveling unnecessarily (e.g. OTN, video conferencing) for follow up clinic appointments.

• Primary care/nephrologist OTN, Telehealth consultations or e-consults.

• Traveling specialty clinics whereby the specialist rotates to an area.

• Provincial Electronic system.
Telehealth programs in BC

- TeleOncology
- TeleThoracic
- TeleHomecare
- TeleWoundcare
- First Nations TeleOphthalmology and
- First Nations Telehealth Expansion.
Reducing financial Inequalities in Health care

- Changes in tax structures, strengthening of services, improved equity in service delivery, and increasing payments through pensions, disability and social assistance.  
- Changing the definition and calculation of household income to grant eligibility to subsidized programs.

1. Raphael, Dennis; “Poverty, Income, Inequality and Health Canada; Toronto: 2002, pp. 8
Medical Transportation

Develop a Medical Transportation Assistance Program to subsidize transportation costs to attend dialysis treatments or home dialysis training, where there is no access to available, accessible and affordable public transit systems.

For example: Rate of mileage reimbursement for attending medical treatments for all chronic illness.
National Pharmacare

New definitions and measurements to evaluate financial eligibility to access services.

- I.e. Household income.
- Out of pocket costs associated with maintaining health and wellbeing, especially in the presence of a chronic illness.
- Developing a national pharmacare system that ensures that the most vulnerable and marginalized individuals are included.

- Income assessments.
- Expanded current drug formulas which include variance in drug dosing.
- EMR system that informed physicians on the costs of medications.
- Decrease the wait times and barriers to gain access to necessary medications that are listed as exceptional use and cancer care/nephrology treatments within the hospital and within the community.
Minimize disparities in **accessing medications and food supplements** for people with kidney disease and develop a mechanism to offset costs equitably based on a patient’s real-time income.

Develop a mechanism to provide help to patients and families who are incurring high treatment-related costs relative to their incomes.
Additional Resources

- https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4291541/
- https://povertyandhumanrights.org/docs/incomeHealth.pdf